

PORT AUTHORITY OF ALLEGHENY COUNTY
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR BOARD MEETING
FRIDAY, JUNE 26, 2015

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Port Authority of Allegheny County was held on Friday, June 26, 2015, at 9:30 a.m., at the Authority's Administration Offices, 345 Sixth Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, 15222-2527, pursuant to due public notice given as required by law.

Board Members:

Robert Hurley, Chair
Jeff Letwin
Senator Jim Brewster (via phone)
Tom Donatelli
Constance Parker
Rob Kania (via phone)
Amanda Green Hawkins
D. Raja
John Tague
Rob Vescio (via phone)
Joel Lennen, General Counsel

Media:

M. Daniels, Tribune Review
Barbara Boylan, KDKA

Port Authority Staff:

Ellen McLean, chief executive officer, Bill Miller, Chief Operations Officer, Jim Ritchie, Communications Officer, Mike Cetra, assistant general manager Legal and Corporate Services, Pete Schenk, chief financial officer, Keith Wargo, assistant general manager Engineering and Technical Support, Barry Adams, assistant general manager Human Resources, Tom Noll, director Technical Support, Dan DeBone, Community and Government Relations officer, Ed Typanski, director Grants and Capital Programs, Amy Silbermann, Data Analyst, Charles Farkas, Route Foreman, Dawn Bagley, bus operator, John DeAngelis, manager Contract Administration, Scott Vetere, director Service Planning, Jackson, Whitmore, Transit Development, Fred Mergner, assistant manager Scheduling and Service Planning, Chris Walker, associate service planner, Breen Masciotra, Communications coordinator, Andrea Elcock, Communications coordinator, Diane Williamson, executive assistant.

Other:

Joe Catanese, County Council, Molly Nichols, PPT, Glen Walsh, Carolyn Lenigan, Pat Miskiewicz, Baldwin, Ray Miskiewicz, Baldwin, Mike Telium, PPT, Dean Mougianis, PPT, Dennis Simon, Chester Engineers, Jonathan Robison, ACTC, Brendon McCarthy, SPG, Alan Sable, Reed Smith, Ken Foltz, Leech Tishman, Steve Palonis, ATU Local 85, Chris Sandvig, PCRG, Karen Smith, Buses for Baldwin, Chris Kuznicki, Buses for Baldwin, Mark Kuznicki, Buses for Baldwin, Patricia Davis, Churchview Garden Apartments, Lian O'Loughlin, PPT, Allison Garcia, Council O'Hara Township.

Following the recital of the pledge of allegiance, the Chairman asked that a roll call be conducted and it was determined that there was a quorum to proceed.

The Chairman called on Ms. Ellen McLean for a report from the Chief Executive Officer.

Ms. McLean had a few items to report. She reported that Board members today will consider approval of Port Authority's FY 2016 Operating and Capital Budgets this morning and wanted to take a moment to point out a few things pertaining to these budgets.

First, while our financial status is much improved, we remain cautious and are somewhat limited in our spending. Still, we're far better off and in a much better place. Our discussions and debates are over where to enhance service, not cut it. We're able to enhance service in very specific areas and we continue to address overcrowding throughout our system.

Ms. McLean noted that there's no fare increase proposed this year and we will be able to address a long list of capital needs. Although these projects often do not attract as much attention as service, investing in our infrastructure is vital as we maintain the service we provide. So the bottom line is, "we're financially solid and the budget reflects that position."

Ms. McLean continued reporting that Board members this morning will also consider the adoption of Service Guidelines. This document spells out how we make service decisions, how we evaluate those routes already on the street and how we evaluate those proposed by individuals, organizations and communities going forward. The document seeks to improve on the guidelines that are already in place. Ms. McLean noted that it makes the process transparent and open and will experience modifications and improvements each year.

Ms. McLean concluded her report by mentioning the recent news of the passing of Lucy Spruill. Lucy was a lifelong advocate and a strong and steady voice for individuals with disabilities. She was the City of Pittsburgh's first ADA Coordinator and was a founding member of the Committee for Accessible Transportation, which is one of two Port Authority advisory committees. Lucy was not afraid to ask the tough questions or to call on an organization to do the right thing. She often did this when nobody else was willing. It's what made her such a prominent voice in our community, and it's what made her so effective. Ms. McLean concluded her report by saying, "that her friends here at Port Authority will miss her."

At this time, recommendation was then made for approval of the minutes of the May 29, 2015 Regular Meeting. A motion was moved, seconded and passed.

The Chairman announced that we are going to delay the public comment period at this time to hear the report of the Performance Oversight Committee.

The Chairman called on Mr. Jeff Letwin for a report of the Performance Oversight Committee.

Mr. Letwin reported that a meeting of the Performance Oversight Committee was held on Thursday, June 18, 2015, and the minutes from the previous meeting were approved by the Committee.

The financial results for the period ending May 2015 were presented at the meeting and Mr. Letwin gave a summary of that report.

It was reported that total operating income exceeded budget by \$192,000 which was predominantly attributable to advertising revenue exceeding budget for the month. Total expenses for the month were \$3.36 million under budget. Savings in diesel fuel and retiree medical premiums contributed to this variance. Total Subsidies for the month were reported \$656,000 under budget as the Authority still awaits FTA approval of a grant associated with the Preventive Maintenance subsidy.

From a year-to-date perspective, total operating income exceeds budget by \$1.72 million due to passenger revenues exceeding plan. Total expenses are \$25.3 million below budget with \$6 million in savings from lower employee benefits and \$7.4 million in savings from lower expenses in materials and supplies which includes diesel fuel savings. Total subsidies through May are on budget, but could end the fiscal year significantly under budget without FTA approval of the grant associated with the preventive maintenance subsidy.

In comparing FY 2015 year-to-date results with FY 2014, it was reported that total operating income is up \$2.3 million from last fiscal year. Total expenses are up almost \$13 million from last fiscal year due to higher wage and benefit expenses. Total subsidies are higher than in FY 2014 due to higher State operating assistance from Act 89.

Mr. Letwin presented six resolutions reviewed at the meeting and are being recommended by the Performance Oversight Committee for consideration this morning:

The Committee first reviewed six procurement actions and found these bids to be in accordance with the Authority's procurement policies and procedures, prices to be fair and reasonable, and the bidders to be responsive and responsible.

The Performance Oversight Committee therefore recommends for award the six items outlined in the Board packet in the total amount of approximately \$8 million.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mr. Letwin respectfully requested approval of the resolution as presented.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved.

Mr. Letwin continued reporting that the next two resolutions he is going to present are related to the same project. The first resolution for consideration authorizes the Authority to enter into a memorandum of understanding with Allegheny County and North Braddock and Swissvale Boroughs for the Tasse Hollow Bridge Rehabilitation project.

Mr. Letwin reported that the Authority is the owner of the Tasse Hollow Bridge which is in need of significant rehabilitation. The approaches to the bridge are located in Allegheny County, North Braddock Borough and Swissvale Borough.

The Authority has publicly solicited bids to identify and retain a contractor to complete the necessary rehabilitation of the bridge and the various approaches. It was determined that the project is in the public interest and will be beneficial and advantageous to the Authority, the County, Braddock and Swissvale.

This resolution would authorize the Authority to enter into a memorandum of understanding, outlined in Exhibit A in the Board packet, with the County and Braddock and Swissvale Boroughs for the purpose of ensuring effective and timely cooperation and coordination among the parties related to the design, construction and staging activities for completion of the project.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mr. Letwin respectfully requested approval of the resolution as presented.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved.

The next resolution authorizes the Authority to award the construction contract for the Tassey Hollow Bridge Rehabilitation project. To perform the work for the project, bid documents were prepared and publicly advertised and two bids were received.

After review of the responsive bids, it was determined that the bid of Mosites Construction Company was the lowest responsive bid from a responsible bidder meeting the Authority's requirements for the contract.

This resolution authorizes the Authority to award the contract to Mosites Construction Company, in the amount of \$3,757,777, subject to the completion of pre-award requirements.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mr. Letwin respectfully requested approval of the resolution as presented.

It was moved, seconded and agreed with one abstention from Mr. Letwin that the resolution be approved.

The next resolution for consideration is authorization to award a construction contract for the Washington Junction Park and Ride Lot Restoration project.

Mr. Letwin reported that the work will include full depth replacement of the concrete and asphalt pavement, sidewalk replacement, drainage system modification, curb replacement and new pavement markings. The parking lot lighting will also be replaced along with an existing retaining wall.

Bid documents were prepared and publicly advertised to perform the work and five bids were received.

It was determined that the bid of Plavchak Construction Company, Inc. was the lowest responsive bid from a responsible bidder meeting the requirements for the contract.

It is recommended that the contract be awarded to Plavchak Construction Company, in the amount of \$1,343,543.10, subject to completion of pre-award requirements.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mr. Letwin respectfully requested approval of the resolution as presented.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved.

Before Mr. Letwin returned to his report, Ms. Hawkins noted a typo on the agenda in regard to the contract number for the Park and Ride Restoration project. The contract number PNR-15-05 REBID is correct in the actual resolution.

Mr. Letwin continued reporting that the next resolution for consideration authorizes the Authority to extend the agreement with Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc., for activities related to the Bus Rapid Transit project.

In July 2011, Port Authority entered into an agreement with Parsons Brinckerhoff to perform an alternatives analysis, a national environmental policy act review and other services in order to qualify for federal funding consideration for a proposed bus rapid transit link between downtown, Oakland and other East End neighborhoods in the City of Pittsburgh.

The services also included an option, to be exercised at the Authority's sole discretion, for the performance of preliminary engineering related to the design of the project.

The agreement provided for an initial term of two years with the option to extend the term up to an additional three years.

The Authority Board previously authorized amendments to the agreement to exercise the first two option years to extend the term to July 31, 2015 and execute the option to perform the preliminary engineering at the amended total not-to-exceed amount of \$5,500,000.

The Authority has determined that it is in its best interest to exercise the third option year and extend the agreement to July 31, 2016 at no increase to the previously approved amount.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mr. Letwin respectfully requested approval of the resolution as presented.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved.

Mr. Letwin stated that the final resolution authorizes the Authority to file grant applications with the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation for Section 1513 State Operating Assistance and Section 1514 State Capital Assistance of Act 89 for funds available in FY 2016.

The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania provides Section 1513 operating assistance and Section 1514 capital improvement assistance to transit operators under the provision of Act 89 of 2013. Port Authority must submit applications to PENNDOT throughout the year to obtain the funds available.

This resolution authorizes the filing of grant applications to receive operating assistance in the amount of \$221,589,338 and capital assistance in the amount of \$106,430,000.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mr. Letwin respectfully requested approval of the resolution as presented.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved.

That concluded the report of the Performance Oversight Committee.

The Chairman proceeded with the public comment period and called the first speaker, Mr. Chris Sandvig, regional policy director for the Pittsburgh Community Reinvestment Group. He stated that for those unfamiliar with PCRG, it represents over 50 community economic development corporations in neighborhoods within the City of Pittsburgh and surrounding communities to revitalize our most distressed neighborhoods, noting that transit is vital to that mission.

As a representative of PCRG, and a long time transit advocate, Mr. Sandvig stated that he is excited to be here today to talk about good things rather than bad. Until about 18 months ago, transit in Allegheny County was under perpetual threat of a third service contraction. While good work to improve service in community connections to transit occurred, it was nearly impossible to think about a better system. Fortunately, because of the hard work of many here today and thousands more; we all have transit funding that has stabilized us for the foreseeable future. We're reaping the benefits of stable funding. Ridership seems to have stabilized and grown. Now, however, new debates have opened that are perhaps more animated than past ones simply because they're among us. We think this is, on a whole, a good thing because now we can think about the system we want rather than simply trying to save what we have.

So the question today for us is how do we improve transit service and with what resources. It has been a very long time since we could ask that. Maybe it's a result of local tools haven't existed to guide those decisions for some time. And this is why we're excited to see the development of Service Guidelines. With the ratification of these guidelines, Port Authority can now access and evaluate openly and publicly the performance of every route it runs. We commend the agency for creating these guidelines, and we appreciate the fine line it has to walk to satisfy as many parties as possible while providing a productive transit service to the County.

Mr. Sandvig noted that we also applaud the Authority on the equity side of the equation for complying with and exceeding Civil Rights Title VI requirements with its recognition of its responsibility to poor communities and individuals as well as the disabled. Perhaps this is best displayed in the guidelines' recommendations for remediation of underperforming routes and the long horizon it gives for those changes to take effect.

As a group working to raise such communities out of persistent and destructive disinvestment and abandonment, PCRG sees these provisions as vital and we're hopeful Port Authority will continue the openness that it's shown with these draft guidelines as it develops score cards and look forward to assisting however we can.

Mr. Sandvig stated, "That which is easy to say but difficult to define, that is, must be adjusted in this process. It should be at the core of any decision about curtailing service on a route or

eliminating altogether and it's been acknowledged in these Guidelines." PCRG looks forward to working with Port Authority and other stakeholders to come up with a definition that works for as many as possible to ensure that service is available to as many Allegheny County residents in need as possible. PCRG feels these guidelines are vital to any future expansion or reconfiguration of transit in Allegheny County that will generate more ridership and spur investment.

Mr. Sandvig concluded his remarks by saying, "PCRG supports these guidelines and hopes the Board does as well."

The Chairman called on Mr. Stuart Strickland, the newly elected President of Allegheny County Transit Council.

Mr. Strickland stated that ACTC's purpose is to advise Port Authority on its regular operations and also provide a sounding board to Port Authority for the man in the street, man in the seat view of how see transit operations.

Mr. Strickland is the 16th ACTC president, but also the seventh ACTC president, as he served back in 1994 and 1995, and the first person to have been elected president twice. Mr. Strickland also served as vice president, 10 years as secretary and briefly, treasurer. During his first term, a "what the riders expect" list was created and they have been around for a while. Every operating division and the old Manchester Boardroom had a copy of this 10 point list hanging on the wall.

Mr. Strickland not only is a member of ACTC but has probably been on 20,000 buses. He is a regular bus rider after losing service during the 2011 cuts. Mr. Strickland stated that with this background, he can safely say that when he talks about Port Authority, he has done his homework.

Right now, ACTC is one-third the size it needs to be, with membership down to 10 people when we should have 30. One of Mr. Strickland's tasks is to rebuild the organization to make sure that it has the statue and significance that it once had.

Mr. Strickland concluded his remarks by stating that he looks forward to a positive productive year working with Port Authority's Board and staff.

The Chairman thanked Mr. Strickland for his service and noted that the Board values the work that he and the transit council does and the input they provide us.

The Chairman called on Mr. Jonathan Robison for his remarks. Mr. Robison stated that he was happy to announce that he has completed his term as an ACTC officer. The new ACTC vice president will be Shirley Atkins.

Mr. Robison was happy that bus service is being restored to transit desert areas of Baldwin and Groveton. Some of the citizens who fought so hard for service, along with leadership from Pittsburghers for Pittsburgh Transit, are at this Board meeting and can best tell you how this service is vital.

The ACTC Policy Committee unanimously recommends opposition to two proposed fare policies. Charging riders for ConnectCards is penny wise and pound foolish. Port Authority's new ConnectCard is an improvement to the efficiency of its system, as well as the convenience to the riding public.

The second opposition is with the proposed abolition of the free-fare zone downtown. It is a step in exactly the wrong direction. Abolition of the fare free zone downtown will encourage more people to drive downtown, even though others will continue to use public transit or ride share. This will exacerbate problems including pollution, parking, traffic congestion, and energy consumption.

The Chairman called on Ms. Chris Kuznicki for her remarks. As a member of Buses for Baldwin, Ms. Kuznicki stated that they appreciate that the Port Authority Board and staff listened to the voices of the people and are responding with service extensions. We are, however, concerned that residents along Willett Road, along with residents in other deserts in the County, are still not having their needs met. We will continue to work to find a solution. We want to say thank you to everyone involved in this effort. Buses for Baldwin flourished under the guidance and determination of Molly Nichols and the organization she represents, Pittsburghers for Public Transit. She then thanked the Steering Committee of Buses for Baldwin, residents of Baldwin and transit workers who supported them.

Ms. Kuznicki noted that we helped everyone understand the plight of those living in transit deserts, and we will continue to push for all residents in our County to have the transit service they need and deserve.

Pittsburghers for Transit is also pleased to see that Port Authority has developed Service Guidelines that make its service planning decisions more transparent and inclusive of the public. We are glad you are working on listening to the communities you serve and enlisting our options and ingenuity before making changes in service.

Ms. Kuznicki concluded her remarks by stating, "Let's keep the public in public transit and you will get a world-class system that connects us all."

The Chairman called on the next speaker, Ms. Linda Scott, for her remarks. Ms. Scott stated that she is from North Braddock, the transit desert, which is a term that was coined along with the Buses for Baldwin Campaign. More specifically, she lives two streets off Willett Road, moving there eight years ago after purchasing a home on the bus line.

The community and the Buses for Baldwin Steering Committee, along with PPT, has spent an extensive amount of time doing door to door work, making phone calls and attending meetings. They appreciate that the Board has listened to their concerns and worked with them to help find a solution, but unfortunately, she is one of those individuals that live off of Willett Road. Ms. Scott urged the Board to look into adjusting the proposed extension to include Willett Road.

The Chairman called on the final speaker of the day, Mr. Darnell Jones, for his remarks. Mr. Jones stated that he is here on behalf of his community, Groveton Village. The residents are

thankful for your consideration of service in this area. Mr. Jones also thanked Ms. Molly Nichols and her organization, Pittsburghers for Public Transit.

Concluding the public process section of the meeting, Mr. Hurley stated that he would like to advocate to all that the show of appreciation this morning is really for the members of our staff who were able to work this out in diligence, and we will be looking to see our ridership increase on those routes, so we can continue them. So please advocate continually within your own community to ride those routes so we do not have to review them in the future.

The Chairman called on Mr. John Tague for a report of the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee.

Before reporting on behalf of the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee, Mr. Tague wanted to echo Ms. McLean's remarks about his friend, Lucy Spruill. Lucy was a tremendous advocate for the civil rights of people with disabilities. But she worked tirelessly for civil rights, especially for women and minorities. Lucy was affirmed in her advocacy yet fair in her approach. The disability community can thank Lucy for her partnership with Port Authority. Mr. Tague said that he will miss Lucy's leadership, her sage, advice and wisdom.

Mr. Tague reported that the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee met on June 18. During the meeting, representatives of the Shannon Transit Village, LP presented a project update and an overview for the Committee. This is a development project planned at the Castle Shannon Station Park and Ride site. The presentation covered the project description, tentative schedule, budget and funding plan.

Next, Mr. Tague presented a resolution for consideration in regard to Port Authority's Operating and Capital Budgets. The Operating Budget totals about \$398 million and the Capital Budget totals around \$175 million. Mr. Tague noted that both budgets balance expenses with anticipated revenues and grants.

On behalf of the Planning and Stakeholders Relations Committee, Mr. Tague respectfully requested approval of the resolution to approve the FY 2016 Port Authority Operating and Capital budgets.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved.

Mr. Tague continued reporting on the next item which was Service Guidelines. He noted that one of the most difficult parts of the Service Guidelines is equity, which Chris Sandvig had mentioned. Mr. Tague then mentioned that the Service Planning staff will come back to the Planning and Stakeholders Relations Committee in the fall to discuss the actual process used in determining service.

The Authority proposes to use a new Service Guideline document which makes the service planning a moot evaluation decision and seeks to improve transparency and clarity in this process. The guidelines were developed by staff and shared publicly through review and feedback.

On behalf of the Planning and Stakeholders Relations Committee, Mr. Tague respectfully requested approval of the resolution to approve the Service Guidelines subject to future amendments deemed necessary by the Board.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved.

There was no further business to conduct.

The next Regular Meeting of the Board will be Friday, July 24, 2015.

The meeting was adjourned.

Approved