PORT AUTHORITY OF ALLEGHENY COUNTY MINUTES OF THE REGULAR BOARD MEETING FRIDAY, MARCH 31, 2017

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Port Authority of Allegheny County was held on Friday, March 31, 2017, at 9:30 a.m., at the Authority's Administration Offices, 345 Sixth Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, 15222-2527, pursuant to due public notice given as required by law.

Board Members:

Jeff Letwin, Acting Chair Senator Jim Brewster Ann Ogoreuc John Tague Rob Vescio Rob Kania Michelle Zmijanac Jen Liptak Joel Lennen, General Counsel

Port Authority Staff:

Ellen McLean, chief executive officer, Bill Miller, chief operations officer, Jim Ritchie, Communications officer, Barry Adams, assistant general manager Human Resources, Mike Cetra, assistant general manager Legal and Corporate Services, Ed Typanski, director Grants and Capital Programs, Catherine Terrill, Professional Services contract specialist, Tony Trona, director Purchasing and Materials Management, Darcy Cleaver, assistant manager Passenger Amenities, Fred Mergner, assistant manager Scheduling and Service Planning, Adam Brandolph, Public Relations representative, Tom Noll, director Technical Support, Dan DeBone, Community and Government Relations Officer, Deborah Skillings, Community Outreach representative, Diane Williamson, executive assistant.

<u>Other</u>

Jim Robinson, ACTC President, Marni Fritz, TMC, Molly Nichols, PPT, James Love, Speaker, Tim Joyce, Senator Brewster's Office, Stacy Chandler, PPT, Steve Palonis, ATU Local 85, Dean Mougianis, PPT, Carolyn Lenigan Monica Ruiz, Speaker, Joan Natko, ACTC, Chandana Cherukupalli, PPT, Jonah McAllister-Erickson, PPT, Christina Castillo, PPT, Jordan Malloy, Mel Packer, PPT, Starr Magwood, PPT, Erica Fooks, PPT.

Mr. Letwin called the meeting to order. Following the recital of the pledge of allegiance, Mr. Letwin announced that the Board is going to change the order of the agenda.

A recommendation was made for approval of the minutes of the February 24 Regular Meeting. A motion was made, seconded and unanimously passed [Ms. Liptak abstained noting that she was not on the Board last month].

Mr. Letwin called on Mr. Kania for a report of the Nominating Committee. Mr. Kania reported that in order to fill the vacancy of the Chairperson for the Board, the Committee nominates Mr. Letwin to serve as Chairperson of the Board for the remainder of 2017. Furthermore, the Committee

nominates Ms. Liptak to serve as Vice Chairperson of the Board for the remainder of 2017, to fill the vacancy created by Mr. Letwin being the Chairperson.

On behalf of the Nominating Committee, Mr. Kania respectfully requested approval of the slate presented by the Committee.

It was moved by Senator Brewster, seconded by Mr. Vescio and unanimously agreed that the proposed slate be approved as presented.

Mr. Letwin thanked the Board members for their confidence in him and his ability to do this. He looks forward to this position and has a great love of this organization and he is happy to step into this position. Mr. Letwin noted that he has big shoes to fill as Mr. Hurley was a great Chairman and was dedicated to this organization.

The Chairman called on Ms. Zmijanac for a report of the Performance Oversight Committee. Ms. Zmijanac reported that a meeting of the Performance Oversight Committee was held on Thursday, March 23, 2017, and the minutes from the previous meeting were approved by the Committee.

The financial results for the month of February 2017 were reported at the meeting. It was reported that total operating income was \$74,616 over budget due to higher ACCESS Program service revenue. Total passenger revenue for the month, however, was \$256,912 under budget. Total Expenses for the month were \$2,082,483 under budget primarily due to savings in fuel and employee benefits.

From a year-to-date perspective, it was reported at the meeting that total operating income is approximately \$472,000 below budget due to passenger revenue and ACCESS Program service revenue being below budget. Total expenses through February were \$17.4 million under budget primarily due to materials and supplies, wages and salaries and employee benefits being under plan.

Total subsidies for the year were \$7.1 million ahead of budget which was reported as simply a timing issue.

Mr. Zmijanac continued reporting that there were two resolutions reviewed by the Performance Oversight Committee for consideration by the Board.

The Committee first reviewed five procurement actions and found the bids to be in accordance with the Authority's procurement policies and procedures, prices to be fair and reasonable, and the bidders to be responsive and responsible. The Performance Oversight Committee therefore recommends for award the five items outlined in the resolution in the total amount of approximately \$1.2 million.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mrs. Zmijanac respectfully requested approval of the resolution.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved as presented.

Next, Ms. Zmijanac reported that the Committee discussed a resolution authorizing the Authority to enter into a Memorandum of Understanding with Robert Morris University for an Employee

Development Program. Pursuant to a resolution passed in October 2016, the Board adopted Strategic Initiatives for FY 2017 to FY 2021.

One of the goals identified in the Strategic Initiatives is to invest in the Authority's workforce to improve workforce stability, accountability and talent growth. In an effort to achieve this goal, staff has negotiated a proposed Memorandum of Understanding with Robert Morris University for a 10-credit Leadership Training Program as set forth on Exhibit A to the resolution.

On behalf of the Performance Oversight Committee, Mrs. Zmijanac respectfully requested approval of the resolution.

It was moved, seconded and unanimously agreed that the resolution be approved as presented.

That concluded the report of the Performance Oversight Committee.

The Chairman called on Mr. Tague for a report of the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee. Mr. Tague reported that the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee met on March 23, where the Committee was provided presentations about two exciting projects, the Envision Pittsburgh's Life on Liberty project and the Bus Rapid Transit project, which involves Port Authority, Allegheny County, the City of Pittsburgh and the URA.

First, Sean Luther, Executive Director of Envision Downtown, discussed the Life on Liberty project. The project is aimed at developing a plan that benefits businesses, improves pedestrian safety and enhances the transit experience. Envision currently is featuring the Liberty Lab where individuals can learn about the project and provide input. The goal of the project is to identify existing challenges along with potential solutions for this downtown artery. Mr. Tague also noted that there is a survey available on Envision's website for anyone interested in participating.

The Committee also heard about the Bus Rapid Transit project from Mr. Justin Miller of City Planning and Ms. Amy Silbermann, senior analyst at Port Authority. Mr. Tague noted that Mr. Miller and Ms. Silbermann have been at the forefront of the public engagement effort involving the BRT project. In addition to presenting it to the Committee, they presented information about the project to numerous community groups, noting that he has heard a great deal of feedback from these organizations and individuals.

Mr. Tague also reported that the community sessions have been productive in giving individuals from areas within the BRT corridor an opportunity to learn and ask questions. In particular, he was thankful for the discussion with the City and County Task Force on Disabilities and the Committee for Accessible Transportation.

Mr. Tague concluded his report by thanking Mr. Miller and Ms. Silbermann for spending time with the CAT Committee on Wednesday answering questions and explaining the various aspects of the project.

That concluded the report of the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee.

Before calling on Ms. McLean for the CEO Report, Mr. Letwin announced the following appointments of committees and committee members:

The Chair of the Performance Oversight Committee will remain Ms. Constance Parker and will include Representative Dom Costa, Ms. Jennifer Liptak, Mr. Robert Vescio and Ms. Michelle Zmijanac.

Mr. Tague will continue as Chair of the Planning and Stakeholder Relations Committee, and the Committee will include Mr. Robert Kania, Ms. Ann Ogoreuc and Mr. D. Raja.

Mr. D. Raja will continue as Chair of the Financial and Audit Committee, and members will include Senator Brewster and Mr. Rob Kania.

Mr. Letwin also appointed a Nominating Committee, that will be chaired by Mr. Rob Kania.

The Governance Committee will be chaired by Mr. Letwin and will include Ms. Parker, Mr. Tague and Mr. Raja.

In addition, Mr. Letwin announced that he has created a special committee for the search for a new candidate for the CEO of Port Authority and has asked Ms. Liptak to Chair that Committee. Members of the Committee include Mr. Tague, Mr. Raja, Representative Costa and Ms. Zmijanac.

The Chairman called on Ms. McLean for the report from the chief executive officer. Ms. McLean first congratulated the Chairman. Ms. Mclean stated that as mentioned in Mr. Tague's report, earlier this month, County Executive, Rich Fitzgerald, Mayor Bill Peduto and Port Authority unveiled an initial proposal for the Bus Rapid Transit project that would run from downtown to Oakland and possibility farther. This transformative project has the potential to grow neighborhoods, to connect communities, to create jobs and provide improved transit options to tens of thousands of people in our community.

Ms. McLean stated that as we progress towards submitting an application to the Federal Transit Administration, there are still some important decisions that we have to make. We have already heard from more than a thousand people at meetings with stakeholders and through our online survey, and we're looking forward to hearing from many more. We're taking all of the input into consideration before we make our decisions on the locally preferred option for infrastructure and service.

Ms. McLean noted that while it's necessary that we make these key decisions quickly in order to submit an application to the FTA this summer, we'll continue to engage residents, businesses and stakeholders in the months ahead on a variety of details, including specific station locations, designs and amenities.

Ms. McLean concluded her report by announcing that on Wednesday, April 5, we are cohosting an open house with the city and county at Alumni Hall in Oakland from noon until 2:00 p.m. and 4:00 to 7:00 p.m. If you don't already know about the BRT project, please join us there. You will see how we came to the options available, and you'll be able to ask questions which we hopefully will be able to answer.

That concluded the report of the chief executive officer.

Before moving onto public comment, Mr. Letwin asked that all of the speakers stay on point to the topic they signed up to speak about. Also, as a reminder, he stated that it is the Board's practice not to engage with the speakers, but that does not mean that we are not listening or care.

Mr. Letwin also stated that we care very deeply about what you have to say with respect to the matter that you're bringing before us, but he requested the speakers to stop attacks on any individual Board members.

The Chairman called on the first speaker, Mr. James Love. Mr. Love stated his concerns and suggestions to create hubs with the BRT and to stop the overlapping of the outlying systems.

The next speaker, Mr. Stuart Strickland, remarked about his concerns with the BRT. He stated that he holds little hope for the plan as written. There is so much infrastructure to construct and so many political and engineering hoops to jump through, it may well be another decade before a single rider can board. In short, instead of dithering over land configurations, station designs, forced transfers and a thousand other details, you could have a functioning plan in place in a matter of months by implementing at least part of the Connect 09 plan to run our routes in conjunction with the existing 61 and 71 series routes, and use existing equipment, routing and stops.

The next speaker, Ms. Erica Fooks, urged the Board to reinstate service to the West Mifflin Estates. She mentioned the hardships of the community without reliable public transportation.

The next speaker, Ms. Starr Magwood thanked all of the councilmen, representatives, Senator Brewster and Representative Gergely and the people in the community that helped thus far with their campaign. Ms. Starr also urged the Board to restore the service to the West Mifflin Estates. She said that she speaks on behalf of the over 200 families in West Mifflin Estates who lost bus service in the 2011 service cuts. While the cuts were to save Port Authority money, it has had a tremendous negative effect on the individuals who rely on service for outside fun and activities, healthcare appointments, education and employment.

The next speaker, Ms. Molly Nichols, who is with Pittsburghers for Public Transit and who has been supporting the residents in West Mifflin Estates, stated that she is echoing their calls for bus service in their community, which is basically a modification of the Y47 or the Y49. They are not asking for a whole new route or significant extension, and they understand that Port Authority is considering requests according to transparent service guidelines processes and hopes that you can find a way to provide the service.

Next, Ms. Nichols pointed out a concern that PPT has with something that recently happened. This March, the agency responded to calls from a group of homeowners on Brighton Woods Road to discontinue service on the 17. Although we understand the importance of listening to concerns from community members, but in this instance, some of the residents on Benton Avenue have now lost that service. We've heard from a few of them about the negative impact this change has caused. The concern is that this change happened not as part of the regular process and the transparent service guidelines. It was at a cost to the agency because the 17 now has to travel to the Ross Garage instead of turning over on Brighton Woods Road.

Ms. Nichols stated that her final issue is the proof of payment policy change. PPT shared some concerns last summer about this. During the public hearings, there was limited information available

other than that change was being proposed. We have been concerned about a lack of transparent processes for development of the policy itself and have trouble understanding how the agency will be able to adequately acknowledge concerns from the public, especially about enforcement penalties and increased policing. We know that these proof of payment systems are on the rise throughout the county. They can improve operations and speedup boarding, but we also have heard in other cities about instances of racial profiling and questions about the relationship between fare inspectors and immigrations and custom enforcement.

Ms. Nichols concluded her report by urging Port Authority to look into this. PPT is concerned that the agency and the public are not ready for this significant of a change to happen in just three months.

The next speaker, Ms. Monica Ruiz, also shared her concerns regarding the new proof of payment policy on the T. She remarked that it is hard to believe that this will not lead to increased racial profiling, and it will certainly undermine community trust. These upcoming plans make it even more urgent for Port Authority to develop policies to protect the civil rights of its residents, and that should include immigrants.

Ms. Ruiz concluded her remarks by urging Port Authority to develop policies that will protect the rights of the residents as well as immigrants in the City of Pittsburgh and that Port Authority not use their power to over-patrol communities.

The final speaker, Ms. Christina Castillo, also shared her concerns regarding the proof of payment policy. She noted that we, the public, are worried about the role of police departments and ICE in the policing and likely profiling of riders on the T, and we are here to acknowledge that this will be harmful to people of color and immigrants and specifically undocumented immigrants if Port Authority police and ICE work hand-in-hand.

Before going on to new business, Mr. Letwin stated to the speakers that as he mentioned before, we heard all of your concerns. We're not deaf to those and we actually listen and take those into consideration in our deliberations.

Under new business, Mr. Letwin welcomed new Board member, Jennifer Liptak, and said that he looks forward to working with her here at the Authority. She's going to bring a lot to what we have to do going forward.

Unfortunately, Mr. Hurley couldn't be here this morning, but Mr. Letwin wanted to present a resolution citing the very long history of Mr. Hurley's involvement in county government and in the community. He has been such an essential part of what we do from a development standpoint, from what we've done on a transit standpoint. He's had numerous Board positions working with urban innovations and now he's going to be working with the Allegheny County Airport Authority, and Mr. Letwin is looking forward to having him as part of that.

There being no further business to conduct. The meeting was adjourned.

The next Regular Meeting of the Board will be Friday, April 28, 2017.